Vol. 20. No. 1, Februari 2020, 69-85

MULTICULTURAL UKHUWAH CONCEPT: The Study of Various Signification on Ukhuwah Perspective of Islamic Elite Religion in Pasuruan District

Makhfud Syawaludin

LAKPESDAM PCNU Kabupaten Pasuruan dan Universitas Yudharta Pasuruan e-mail: syawaludin.pasca@yudharta.ac.id

Abstract

The purpose of this research is to describe and analyze the meaning and categorize the ukhuwah based on KH. Ahmad Shiddiq, namely Ukhuwwah Islamiyyah, Ukhuwwah Wathaniyyah, and Ukhuwwah Basyariyyah in the perspective of the Islamic elite in Pasuruan Regency. This research is using qualitative methodology with a phenomenological approach, unstructured and open interview data collection methods, moderate participatory observation, and documentation. Furthermore, the analysis and interpretation of data according to Miles and Huberman (1984) through the following steps: a). Data reduction, b). Display data, and c). Conclusion drawing/verification. For data validity, using triangulation techniques or methods and triangulation of data or sources. This research is important to look for alternative narratives from phenomenon of the politicization of ukhuwah narrow one. This article is the first in discussing the various perspectives of Islamic religious elites in interpreting and implementing ukhuwah and formulating the concept of multicultural ukhuwah.

Keywords: *The Meaning of Ukhuwah; Islamic Elite; Multicultural Ukhuwah.*

Abstrak

Penelitian ini bertujuan untuk mendeskripsikan dan menganalisis makna dan kategorisasi ukhuwah berdasarkan pemikiran KH. Ahmad Shiddiq, yakni Ukhuwwah Islamiyyah, Ukhuwwah Wathaniyyah, dan Ukhuwwah Basyariyyah dalam perspektif elit agama Islam Kabupaten Pasuruan. Adapun metodologi penelitiannya adalah kualitatif dengan pendekatan fenomenologi, dengan metode pengumulan data wawancara tak struktur dan terbuka, observasi partisipatif moderat, dan dokumentasi. Selanjutnya dilakukan analisis dan penafsiran data menurut Miles dan Huberman (1984) dengan melalui langkah-langkah: a). Data reduction, b). Data display, dan c). Conclusion drawing/verification. Untuk keabsahan data, menggunakan triangulasi teknik dan triangulasi data. Penelitian ini penting dilakukan untuk mencari narasi alternatif dari fenomena politisasi ukhuwah yang sempit. Artikel ini menjadi yang pertama dalam membahas ragam persepktif elit agama Islam dalam memaknai dan mengimplementasikan ukhuwah serta merumuskan konsep ukhuwah multikultural.

Kata Kunci: Makna Ukhuwah; Elit Agama Islam; Ukhuwah Multikultural.

مستخلص

مدف هذه الدراسة إلى وصف وتحليل معنى وتصنيف الأخوة على أساس أحمد شديديك ، وهم الأخوة الإسلامية ، الأخوة الوطنية ، وأخوة البصيرية في منظور النخبة الإسلامية في باسوروان ريجنسي. منهجية البحث هي نوعية مع مج الظواهر ، مع أساليب جمع بيانات مقابلة مفتوحة وغير منظم ، والمراقبة التشاركية المعتدلة ، والوثائق. علاوة على ذلك ، تحليل وتفسير البيانات وفقا لمايلز وهوبرمان (1984) من خلال

الخطوات التالية: أ). تخفيض البيانات ، ب). عرض البيانات ، و ج). استنتاج الرسم / التحقق. من أجل صحة البيانات ، استخدم تقنيات التثليث وتثليث البيانات. هذا البحث مهم للبحث عن روايات بديلة لظاهرة التسييس الضيق للأخوة. هذا المقال هو الأول في مناقشة مختلف وجهات نظر النحبة الدينية الإسلامية في تفسير وتطبيق الأخوة وصياغة مفهوم الأخوة متعدد الثقافات.

الكلمات الرئيسيّة: معنى الأخوة; النحبة الإسلامية; الأخوة متعدد الثقافات.

A. INTRODUCTION

At the annual MPR-RI sessions in 1999 and 2000, the political agenda of Islamic fundamentalist groups by replacing Pancasila was a failure. Since that, there was a shifting on the political agenda by Islamic fundamentalist groups that changed macro to micro. One of the political agenda is formalization Islamic law in regional regulations. Meanwhile, according to Rumadi, the wave transfer of Islamization being with the formalization of Islamic law, while diverting the wave of perverting on certain streams and other religious corrections is a sign of a disturbing phenomenon on religious life in Indonesia. Both of these phenomena pose a serious threat to pluralism, human rights, and democratization in Indonesia.

Recognizing the phenomenon of religious fundamentalism, the developing Islamic typology and the majority in Indonesia has a contrary attitude to the typology of fundamentalist Islam, namely Islam Nusantara.³ A typology of Islam that is friendly, polite, tolerant, accommodates local wisdom and resolves the relationship between religion and the state, by promoting ukhuwah and peace has provided a new discourse and balance in understanding the true Islam for the citizens in Indonesia and even the world. More than that, the concept of Nusantara Islam is expected and proven to be able to shift the understanding of

¹Read Yenny Zannuba Wahid, "Pancasila Dan Sejumlah Tantangannya," in *Dasar-Dasar Multikultural*, *Teori Dan Praktek*, ed. M. Kholid Murtadlo (Pasuruan: Yudharta Press, 2011). 1-2.

²Rumadi, "Mengawal Pluralisme Di Tengah Kegamangan Negara," in *Politisasi Agama Dan Konflik Komunal: Beberapa Isu Penting Di Indonesia*, ed. Rumadi dan Ahmad Suaedy (Jakarta: The Wahid Institute, 2007). 2.

³According to the researcher, even though the idea with the term Nusantara Islam is relatively new, it represents a great idea of Islamic reform (neo-modernism) in Indonesia, such as the idea of Cak Nur (Nurcholis Madjid) related to Indonesian-Islamic Islam. The concept of Islamic Nusantara is also a continuation of two renewal projects by Gus Dur, namely the pribumisasi Islam and the completion of religious and state relations. Explanation of the Gus Dur renewal project, see Hairus Salim HS, "Pembaharuan Abdurrahman Wahid: Gagasan Dan Strategi," in *Bahan Bacaan Kelas Pemikiran Gus Dur*, n.d. 3-16.

Islam which today is more represented by the typology of radical Islam as happened in the Middle East today.⁴

When we connected in responding the phenomenon of religious fundamentalism which is happening today,⁵ Nusantara Islam which was developed by the Ulama Nusantara since walisongo until today, mainly by Nahdlatul Ulama and including Muhammadiyah,⁶ has provided many examples and new ideas related to Islamic discourse in Indonesia, including ideas and solutions to religious life in multicultural societies as well as ideas and solutions to religious life in state life, such as when KH. Ahmad Shiddiq (NU figure) emphasized the importance of maintaining ukhuwah⁷ in religious and state life in Indonesia. *Ukhuwwah* is divided into three, namely: *Ukhuwwah Islamiyyah* (brotherhood of fellow Muslims), *Ukhuwwah Wathaniyyah* (brotherhood of fellow citizens), and *Ukhuwwah Basyariyyah* (brotherhood of fellow human beings).⁸ According to KH. Husein Muhammad, the three ideas of ukhuwah, showed that pluralism (one of the three multicultural values. One of the others namely Democracy and Humanism), has been accepted by Islamic scholars of NU and Muhammadiyah, as well as their followers based on Islamic teachings.⁹

In the opinion of researchers, the agenda of Islamic fundamentalist groups can be dammed by the majority of Muslims in Indonesia. It is different when the Islamic fundamentalist group succeeded in making DKI Jakarta Governor Basuki Djahaja Purnama or Ahok's statement related to allowing non-Muslim leaders to become a blasphemy case. Then there were differences of opinion related to the verse in the Surah Al-Maidah by the scholars

⁴Read M. Fajar Marta, "Islam Nusantara Untuk Dunia," in *Nasionalisme Dan Islam Nusantara*, ed. Abdullah Ubaid dan Mohammad Bakir (Jakarta: PT Kompas Media Nusantara, 2015). 63-64.

⁵In addition to religious conflicts that have occurred before, horizontal conflicts caused by the issue of blasphemy, debates in the selection of state leaders in the context of religious law, differences in interpretation of the verses of the Koran, to the issue of solving Muslims by non-Muslims coloring in 2016 to 2017.

⁶Zakiya Darajat, "Muhammadiyah Dan NU: Penjaga Moderatisme Islam Di Indonesia," *HAYULA: Indonesian Journal of Multidisciplinary Islamic Studies* Volume 1 (2017). 83-98. Evidently, when there was a demonstration on behalf of Bela Islam in the (allegedly) blasphemy case by the Governor of DKI, Basuki Djahaja Purnama or Ahok, President Jokowi visited to consolidate with NU and Muhammadiyah, not only to cool the atmosphere at that time, as well as discussing the current conditions. the nation, such as humanity, economy and radicalism. "Presiden: NU Penyangga Utama NKRI," *Majalah Nahdlatul Ulama AULA* (Surabaya, 2016). 54.

⁷The concept of Ukhuwah can be traced in the main sources of Islamic law, namely the Qur'an and al-Hadith. Based on the interpretation of al-Misbah by M. Quraish Sihab, based on the analysis conducted by Syarifah Laili, ukhuwah includes ukhuwah fi al-ubudiyyah, ukhuwah fi al-Insaniyyah/Basyariyah, ukhuwah annasab wa al-wataniyyah, and ukhuwah fi ad-din al -Islam. Syarifah Laili, "Studi Analisis Ayat-Ayat Ukhuwah Dalam Tafsir Al-Misbah Karya M. Quraish Sihab" (UIN Sumatera Utara Medan, 2016). 114-115.

⁸According to KH. Said Aqil Siroj, in NU, the three ukhuwah worked in harmony to form a configuration that was in harmony with the interests of the Unitary Republic of Indonesia (NKRI). Said Aqil Siroj, "Menjaga Marwah Ulama," in *Nasionalisme Dan Islam Nusantara*, ed. Abdullah Ubaid dan Mohammad Bakir (Jakarta: PT Kompas Media Nusantara, 2015). 55.

⁹Read Husein Muhammad, "Prolog: Pluralisme Sebagai Keniscayaan Teologis," in *Argumen Pluralisme Agama: Membangun Toleransi Berbasis Al-Qur'an* (Depok: Penerbit Kata Kita, 2009). xiii-xiv.

and figures in each of the Islamic organizations, so that one group of Islamic organizations assumed that Muslims had been divided by non-Muslims. Uproar due to differences opinion at the same time framed with utterances of hatred continued both through electronic media, social media, and through scholars and leaders of Islamic organizations (Islamic religious elites) throughout Indonesia. The atmosphere of the conflict also spread throughout Indonesia, including in the Pasuruan region. "Now Muslims are divided by non-Muslims, because some Muslims defend Ahok who is not Muslim". "Until finally, religious politicization again occurred, especially through or using ukhuwah discourse. Thus, there were a number of flow and/in Islamic organizations which prioritized their *ukhuwwah Islamiyyah* in state life, while other schools and/or Islamic organizations argued otherwise. ¹²

So, this research is important to be done to look for alternative narratives from the phenomenon of politicization the narrow ukhuwah. Moreover, in previous articles and studies, such as articles written by Muhammad Chirzin¹³ and Hamidah,¹⁴ they only present the ideal meaning of ukhuwah in Islam in relation to harmony and humanity and have not presented a

¹⁰As many as 100 masses of Muslims in Pandaan and Bangil Districts took to the streets leading to Pasuruan Regional Police (28/10/2016). See Ahmad, "Muslim Pandaan: 'Kita Doakan Polisi Segera Menangkap Ahok Atau Biar Malaikat Maut Segera Menangkapnya,"" m.hidayatullah.com, http://m.hidayatullah.com/berita/nasional/read/2016/10/29/103713/muslim-pandaan-kita-doakan-polisi-segeramenangkap-ahok-atau-biar-malaikat-maut-segera-menangkapnya.html. Even when there was a momentum for the National Santri Day, in Pasuruan the social media circulated related to the recruitment of santri who dared to die in order to oversee the MUI fatwa. "Gelorakan Resolusi Jihad, Santri Pasuruan Deklarasi Pasukan Berani MUI," www.viralnusantara.com, Pengawal Fatwa http://www.viralnusantara.com/2016/10/gelorakan-resolusi-jihad-santri.html. "Beredar Pesan Broadcast Ajakan Untuk Jadi Pasukan Berani Mati," www.kabarpas.com, 2016, http://www.kabarpas.com/beredar-pesanbroadcast-ajakan-jadi-pasukan-berani-mati/. Then along with the 212th Action with the theme of Bela Islam, HTI (Hizb ut-Tahrir Indonesia) DPD II Pasuruan held a similar action after the Friday Prayer at the Jami Mosque 'Alun-Alun Bangil Pasuruan Regency. Indri, "HTI DPD II Pasuruan Gelar Aksi Bela Islam Jilid III," pasuruantoday.net, 2016, http://pasuruantoday.net/info-pasuruan/hti-dpd-ii-pasuruan-gelar-aksi-bela-islam-jilidiii/. Furthermore, some Pasuruan residents coordinated by FUIB (United Muslim Forum) are ready to go to Jakarta to defend Islam and defend the ulamas who are harassed and criminalized. Harun S, "Ratusan Pembela Ulama Pasuruan Bergerak Menuju Jakarta," seruji.com, 2017, https://seruji.co.id/daerah/jatim/ratusan-pembelaulama-pasuruan-bergerak-menuju-jakarta/. Even Pasuruan NU took part in carrying out the Martial Arts Action, following the East Java PWNU which gave an objection letter to PBNU regarding Ahok's remarks to KH. Ma'ruf Amin. Adhila, "Protes Perlakuan Ahok Kepada KH Maruf Amin, NU Pasuruan Gelar Aksi Bela Ulama," http://www.suara-islam.com, 2017, http://www.suara-islam.com/read/index/21295/Protes-Perlakuan-Ahokkepada-KH-Maruf-Amin--NU-Pasuruan-Gelar-Aksi-Bela-Ulama.

¹¹Said one of the villagers in Pasuruan Regency during a casual conversation with the researcher (March 2017). Not only that, the writings scattered in one of the researchers' WhatApp Group, are concerned with the frame of hate speech happening. In the text are worried about division and civil war between Muslims. Where in remote areas our fellow Muslims are hostile but with non-Muslims defending it all even said to defend him happily (March 2017).

¹²NU for example, is well aware to prioritize ukhuwwah wathaniyyah in fostering the diversity of the nation in order to remain strong in unity. Although basically, the three ukhuwahs in the national context have their respective portions that are balanced. Siroj, "Menjaga Marwah Ulama." 55.

¹³Muhammad Chirzin, "Ukhuwah Dan Kerukunan Dalam Perspektif Islam," *Aplikasia: Jurnal Aplikasi Llmu-Ilmu Agama* VIII, no. 1 (June 2007).

¹⁴Hamidah, "Al-Ukhuwah al-Ijtima'iyah Wa al-Insaniyah: Kajian Terhadap Pluralisme Agama Dan Kerjasama Kemanusiaan," *Intizar* 21, no. 2 (2015).

variety of perspectives on thinking about ukhuwah. Then the research conducted by Syarifah Laili, ¹⁵ despite studying modern thought related to the concept of ukhuwah, unfortunately only focused on M. Quraish Sihab's thoughts about ukhuwah in the Al-Misbah Tafsir.

Therefore, this study aims to describe and analyze the meaning and categorization of ukhuwah based on KH. Ahmad Shiddiq namely Ukhuwwah Islamiyyah (brotherhood of fellow Muslims), Ukhuwwah Wathaniyyah (brotherhood of fellow citizens), and Ukhuwwah Basyariyyah (brotherhood of fellow humans) in the perspective of the Islamic elite of Pasuruan Regency. The research methodology is qualitative with a phenomenological approach, with unstructured and open interview data collection methods, moderate participatory observation, and documentation. Furthermore, the analysis and interpretation of data according to Miles and Huberman (1984) through the following steps: a). Data reduction, b). Display data, and c). Conclusion drawing/verification. ¹⁶ For data validity, use triangulation techniques or methods and triangulation of data or sources. Thus, this research is the first in discussing the various perspectives of the Islamic elite in interpreting and implementing ukhuwah, especially the perspective of the Islamic elite of Pasuruan Regency. Researchers chose eight Islamic elite in Pasuruan Regency. Representing the two largest mass organizations namely Nahdlatul Ulama and Muhammadiyah. Academics are represented by ICMI and Lecturers. State religious institutions, namely MUI and FKUB. Finally, researchers took caregiver boarding school and from the Shiite group.

B. DISCUSSION

1. Variety of Perspective Understanding Ukhuwah

The diverse perspectives of the Islamic elite in Pasuruan on interpreting ukhuwah, can be divided into three perspectives, namely the exclusive, pseudo-inclusive, and inclusive-pluralist perspectives.

First. An exclusive perspective, which assumes that the term ukhuwah is only for fellow Muslims. This perspective, as stated by KH. Imron Mutamakkin, chairman of the Pasuruan Regency PCNU, said that the concept of ukhuwah was only for fellow Muslims and fellow believers. This perspective, in line with Hasan Ayyub's opinion, ¹⁷ that ukhuwah in Islam is someone who has a strong faith, submits to Islamic law, has a strong relationship with its creator, loves, and hates someone because of God. This perspective uses the basis of

¹⁵Laili, "Studi Analisis Ayat-Ayat Ukhuwah Dalam Tafsir Al-Misbah Karya M. Quraish Sihab."

Sugiyono, Metode Penelitian Kualitatif, Kualitatif, Dan R&D (Bandung: Alfabeta, 2012). 246.
 Read Hasan Ayyub, Etika Islam (Menuju Kehidupan Yang Hakiki) (Bandung: Trigenda Karya, 1994).
 393-394.

Surah Al-Hujuraat Verse 10 and the hadith of the Prophet which has meaning; "*The Muslim is a Muslim brother*."

As for non-Muslims, according to Mutamakkin, it is only a practice of the fulfillment of rights as humans in social life have the same rights of life, neighboring rights, the right to protect and protect the territory, and others. Fulfillment of these rights as the rights of infidels dzimmi, namely infidels or non-Muslims who live in Muslim areas.¹⁸

Second. Pseudo-Inclusive Perspective. A view that gives different treatment based on differences in beliefs or religion, after realizing the existence of multiple realities of life. So, interpreting ukhuwah, there tends to be more value when it is interwoven in the bonds of fellow Muslims. In this perspective, like Dr. Zainal Abidin Bilfaqih, M.Pd., (Chair of ICMI Pasuruan Regency), KH. Nurul Huda Muhammad (Chairman of the MUI of Pasuruan Regency), and Muhammad Okbah (Chair of PD Muhammadiyah of Pasuruan Regency).

According to Dr. Zainal Abidin Bilfaqih, ukhuwah is an awareness of differences in the brotherhood. Differences in language, ethnicity, and religion are the will of God so they must respect each other, respect each other, and not weaken and insult each other. By realizing and understanding the nature of these differences, creating togetherness becomes important. Related to differences in beliefs or religions, he believes that Islam is the truest religion and does not impose these beliefs. So that in doing muamalah and getting a diverse community life can coexist well and peacefully. In addition, ukhuwah awareness was to humans, not to the teachings or beliefs. So, ukhuwah merges the lives of fellow human beings to cooperate with each other and so on while respecting each other's differences in beliefs and understandings, both internally in religion and between religions. ¹⁹

While KH. Nurul Huda Muhammad defines ukhuwah by providing categorization which includes *ukhuwwah Islamiyyah*, *ukhuwwah Wathaniyyah*, and *ukhuwwah Basyariyyah*. For *ukhuwwah Wathaniyyah* is an effort to defend the country and ensure the country's leaders in the welfare of society. For *ukhuwwah Islamiyyah* is mutual assistance in Islamic affairs and humanitarian affairs. While *ukhuwwah Basyariyyah*, still see the status of his religion. If you are Muslim, like *ukhuwwah Islamiyyah*. If other religions, only help each other in humanitarian matters. ²⁰ Likewise, according to Muhammad Okbah, ukhuwah can be due to faith, nationality, and humanity. Related to the foundation of ukhuwah in the Qur'an is Surat al-Hujurat verse 10. In the verse there is the word *faaslikhu*, which shows that ukhuwah

¹⁸Imron Mutamakkin, July 25, 2018.

¹⁹Zainal Abidin Bilfaqih, April 18, 2018.

²⁰Nurul Huda Muhammad, July 30, 2018.

among believers becomes a way of peace when there are differences even when disunity occurs.²¹

Based on the three views above, despite being aware of differences in and between religions, it has a tendency to talk about fellow Muslims. The understanding of ukhuwah which has a tendency towards brotherhood of fellow Muslims, is in line with the thoughts of Mustafa Al-Maraghi, Dr. Wahbah Az-Zuhaili,²² and KH. Miftah Faridl.²³

Third. Inclusive-Pluralist Perspective. A view that defines ukhuwah is a brotherhood of humanity, so it does not question differences in religious, religious, ethnic, and ethnic sects. In this perspective, like Dr. H. Munif, M.Ag., (Academics & Bureaucrats), Abdillah bin Hamid Baabud (Shia Cleric and Chairman of ABI East Java), KH. Moh. Sholeh Bahruddin (Nurse of Pasuruan Ponpes Ngalah), and Dr. H. Saifulah, MHI. (Head of Pasuruan Regency FKUB).

According to Dr. H. Munif, M.Ag., the substance of ukhuwah is mutual trust between fellow human beings regardless of differences in status and beliefs because all humans are brothers. He also disagreed with the categorization of ukhuwah which included *ukhuwwah Islamiyyah*, *ukhuwwah Wathaniyyah*, and *ukhuwwah Basyariyyah* because the categorization effort originated from a community reality that still could not implement the substance of the ukhuwah. He discusses two ukhuwah categorizations based on their implementation, namely:

1). Ukhuwah Substantial, a ukhuwah among humans who no longer needs conditions or criteria, 2). Non-substantial Ukhuwah, a ukhuwah which is carried out with certain criteria, conditions and agreements.²⁴

Then Abdillah bin Hamid Baabud, defines ukhuwah as defined by Sayyidina Ali ibn Abi Talib r.a, namely *Imma akhun laka fiddin au nadhirun laka filkholq*, that human beings can become brothers because of the same religion, sometimes being brothers because of their fellow humans.²⁵ Then, KH. Moh. Sholeh Bahruddin, stated ukhuwah was brotherhood, not hostility. That means, when wrong in understanding ukhuwah will be able to cause hostility. Thus, only ukhuwah based on compassion can realize ukhuwah as a brotherhood. That way, will be able to live side by side in peace and harmony in the reality of a pluralistic society.²⁶ The meaning of ukhuwah above, is in line with the definition of ukhuwah according to M. Quraish Shihab, that ukhuwah is not only a thousand, half-sibling or siblings, but also the

²¹Muhammad Okbah, October 10, 2017.

²²See Salim A. Fillah, *Dalam Dekapan Ukhuwah* (Yogyakarta: Pro-U Media, 2010). 28-29.

²³See K.H. Miftah Faridl, *Lentera Ükhuwah: Indahnya Saling Menyayang Dalam Dekapan Iman* (Bandung: PT Mizan Pustaka, 2014). 21.

²⁴Munif, September 26, 2017.

²⁵Abdillah bin Hamid Baabud, October 10, 2017.

²⁶Moh. Sholeh Bahruddin, October 11, 2017.

similarity of ethnic, religious, and water elements in order to create harmony in human relations.²⁷

Finally, Dr. H. Saifulah, MHI., Understands that ukhuwah originates from the nature of all humans is a brother because of one descendant from the Prophet Adam. In the Qur'an, it is called *ummatan wahidatan*. As in Surah Al-Baqarah verse 213, Surah Al-Mukminun verse 52, and Surah Al-Anbiyaa verse 92. According to him, the practice of *ukhuwwah Islamiyyah* is still limited to fellow Muslims, so it is exclusive. So, he discusses Ukhuwah Mukminin, inclusive, namely a brotherhood among people who believe, who acknowledge is the One God, whatever the name of religion or belief. In this case, the meaning of faith is not limited to the faith of Muslims, but applies to all religions.²⁸

Regarding the believing ukhuwah discussed by Dr. H. Saifulah, MHI., In line with the concept of *ukhuwwah imaniyah* mentioned by KH. Said Aqil Siroj and Maulana Abul Kalam Azad's ideas related to religious unity (*wahdat-e-din*) and universal brotherhood. *Ukhuwwah Imaniyah* (Interfaith Brotherhood) includes interfaith fraternity and creed. This is based on the life of the Prophet when he was in a pluralistic Medina so that an agreement was made called the *Shahifah al-Madinah* (Medina Certificate).²⁹ As for the notion of religious unity (*wahdat-e-din*) and preaching universal brotherhood by Maulana Abul Kalam Azad, a mufassir from India who wrote the commentary on Tarjuman al-Qur'an, referring to a number of verses of the Koran such as Al-Mu 'minun, namely verses 23, 32, 45 and 50-53. Azad also stated that the message preached by every Prophet was that humans were actually one people and one community (Surat Yunus verse 19 and Surat Al-Baqarah verse 213), and that there was only one God for all humans, and that for this reason they had to serve in Him and live like a family.³⁰ At least that is the various meanings of ukhuwah in Islam. We can choose which meaning ukhuwah which according to us is closer to harmony among human beings who are in reality very diverse. To be sure, for researchers, the religion of Islam is the religion of *Rahmatan Lil 'Alamin*.

2. The Dynamics of the Struggle about the Meaning of Ukhuwwah Islamiyyah

According to Dr. H. Munif, M.Ag., as the ukhuwah categorization which includes substantial ukhuwah and non-substantial ukhuwah, substantial ukhuwah Islamiyyah aims to

²⁷Laili, "Studi Analisis Ayat-Ayat Ukhuwah Dalam Tafsir Al-Misbah Karya M. Quraish Sihab." 113-114.

²⁸Saifulah, September 30, 2017.

²⁹Read Said Aqil Siroj, *Tasawuf Sebagai Kritik Sosial: Mengedepankan Islam Sebagai Inspirasi, Bukan Aspirasi* (Bandung: PT Mizan Pustaka, 2006). 60-63.

³⁰Mun'im Sirry, *Polemik Kitab Suci: Tafsir Reformis Atas Kritik Al-Qur'an Terhadap Agama Lain* (Jakarta: PT Gramedia Pustaka Utama, 2013). 103-104.

encourage and support each other to become Muslim who kaffah while helping one another in daily life. In line with that, according to KH. Nurul Huda Muhammad and KH. Imron Mutamakkin, *ukhuwwah Islamiyyah* must help each other in matters of religion and humanitarian matters.

While Abdillah bin Hamid Baabud, as a Shia cleric, began his explanation with regard to *ukhuwwah Islamiyyah* by asserting the condition of being Muslim is to say two sentences of shahada. So, to become a Muslim is to become another Muslim brother. He also stressed that *ukhuwwah Islamiyyah* did not make the differences between Muslims must be merged into one. Like ukhuwah between Sunni and Shia, it does not fuse each other's religious understanding. However, various Islamic groups and organizations still have similarities and differences, but can be united because fellow brothers must respect each other and do joint activities for mutual benefit. Likewise Dr. Zainal Abidin Bilfaqih, M.Pd., stated that through the spirit of *ukhuwwah Islamiyyah*, various differences in Muslims do not have to be forced to be the same, the important thing is to keep from preventing conflicts in the community.

Besides Baiat Islam, Dr. H. Saifulah, MHI., Introduced the existence of Baiat Iman and Baiat Ikhsan. According to him, when a person after becoming a Muslim (*baiatul* Islam) and having taken the faith, will have the awareness that all who have faith, namely those who believe in the existence of One God, whatever their groups and sects, even the differences in creed after the shahada remain a brother. The Baiat Ikhsan is a promise to become a Mukhsin, that is, to apply the Ikhsan principles in Islam. According to him, people who have made Baiat Ikhsan are "people who do good to anyone, anywhere, and at any time." Saving researchers, people can be said to have implemented *ukhuwwah Islamiyyah* when they took the allegiance of Islam, Faith, and Ikhsan.

As for Muhammad Okbah, he further explained the foundation of ukhuwah in the Qur'an in verse 10 of al-Hujurat, the word *faaslikhu* shows that ukhuwah among believers becomes a way of peace when differences occur even when a division occurs. So, it is not surprising when KH. Moh Sholeh Bahruddin in defining ukhuwah by reaffirming its meaning that ukhuwah is brotherhood, not hostility.

In addition, *Ukhuwwah Islamiyyah* is not only related to the brotherhood of fellow muslims. As Dr. H. Saifullah, M.HI, that *ukhuwwah Islamiyyah* was built from Baiat Islam, Baiat Iman and Baiat Ikhsan. The meaning is in line with the concept of *ukhuwwah*

³¹As he said when he was the Speaker in the Gus Dur Prayer & Ngaji activities. Saifulah, *Doa & Ngaji Gus Dur dalam memperingati Harlah Gus Dur ke-77 dengan tema "Melacak Spiritualitas Gus Dur*," Agustus 2017.

Islamiyyah M. Quraish Shihab, that the meaning of *ukhuwwah Islamiyyah* is sometimes interpreted as "brotherhood between fellow Muslims", where the word "*Islamiyyah*" refers to the perpetrators and sometimes also interpreted as "fraternity that is Islamic or taught by Islam", where here the word "*Islamiyyah*" is understood as an adjective. Based on the second articulation, various ukhuwah categorizations, which include brotherhood of supremacy and submission to Allah (*ukhuwwah fi al-ubudiyyah*), humanitarian brotherhood (*ukhuwwah fi al-insaniyyah/basyariyyah*), brotherhood in descent and nationality (*ukhuwwah fi al-ubab wayyah al-wataniyyah*), brotherhood among fellow Muslims or brotherhood of the faith (*ukhuwwah fi ad-din al-islam*) is it self accommodated.³² It is supported that in the Qur'an and the Hadith as a source of Muslim law introduces various fraternities.³³

3. Debate Room in Ukhuwwah Wathaniyyah

The Islamic Elite in Pasuruan on interpreting *ukhuwwah Wathaniyyah*, agreed to be meaningful in protecting the homeland, namely Indonesia, and helping each other among citizens regardless of religious, ethnic and linguistic differences. The difference, only Dr. Zainal Abidin Bilfaqih, M.Pd., who proposed the meaning of *ukhuwwah Wathaniyyah* in a broader meaning. This is based on the call of the previous archipelago scholars, namely *hubbul wathan minal iman*, using *wathan* instead of *bilad*. According to him, there is something that must be developed from the statement. Because, we can not be sure that there will be a change, including changes to the current Homeland. Nevertheless, it is fine when there is a meaning of *wathan* is Indonesia. Furthermore, according to him, when *Wathaniyyah* has a broader meaning than a country, a principle is born that wherever we stand on the ground and drink its water, take advantage of it, that's where we have to uphold it.

That way, the Islamic religious elite in Pasuruan no longer questions between religion and the state or homeland. Of course it can not be separated from the legacy of KH. Hasyim Ash'ari, who provided the basis for the merging of religious zeal with nationalism in Indonesia. According to KH. Hasyim Ash'ari, defending the motherland and the nation is a form of nationalism and love of religion. So, with the defense of the motherland also becomes a form of defense against religion. Moreover, according to KH. Said Aqil Siradj., the expression of *hubbul wathan minal iman*, the love of the motherland is part of faith is an

³²Laili, "Studi Analisis Ayat-Ayat Ukhuwah Dalam Tafsir Al-Misbah Karya M. Quraish Sihab." 60.

³³Ngainun Naim, *Islam Dan Pluralisme Agama: Dinamika Perebutan Makna* (Yogyakarta: Aura Pustaka, 2014). 75.

³⁴Read Yusrianto, "Pemikiran Politik Dan Perjuangan KH. M. Hasyim Asy'ari Melawan Kolonialisme," *IN RIGHT: Jurnal Agama Dan Hak Azazi Manusia* 3, no. 2 (2014). 269.

expression of Hadratussyekh KH. Hasyim Asy'ari. In fact, at that time (1915) there were no great scholars in the world who dared to declare the *hubbul wathan minal iman*.³⁵

So, where is the debate room in the practice of *ukhuwwah wathaniyyah*? In this paper, we will discuss the opinions of the elite of the Islamic religion in electing state leaders.

According to Dr. H. Munif, M.Ag., in choosing the leader of the country, must be distinguished when choosing *sulthon*, namely the President, by selecting his representatives such as the DPR, the Governor, the Regent, and the Village Head. For Muslims, when choosing a president, they must be Muslim. If Muslims do not elect a president who is Muslim, "he has a problem, he commits immorality like him *wayahe sholat, gak sholat.*" ³⁶ For Muslims whose minority is conditional in nature. When there are candidates who are Muslims, do not vote for them, it means that you do not obey religion. When there is no other choice for Muslims, it is permissible. Whereas when electing representatives such as the DPR, the Governor, the Regent, and the Village Head, it is permissible not to be a Muslim as long as it is not detrimental.

In line with that, KH. Imron Mutamakkin, stated that personally must choose a religious leader. The necessity of choosing an Islamic leader is in the Book of Zubad, it is explained that Muslims will hand over religious affairs to their country's leaders. In the book also explained that the conditions of a ruler, be it called an imam or download *shulton*, must be Muslim, because it will regulate the Islamic community. In fact, when the country is controlled by non-Muslims, we may leave the country. Furthermore, KH. Nurul Huda Muhammad, stated that electing leaders for Muslims had two conditions. First, Islam. "The conditions must be Islam, because those who are led are the majority of Islam, if not the majority of Islam, still Muslims must be led by Muslims, if infidels are not allowed, yes 51 it (Read: Al-Maidah Verse 51)." Secondly, have knowledge and ability in managing the country. In fact, the law to designate itself as a leader for some Muslims is Fardlu Ain. When there are no Muslim leaders, all Muslims will sin. In this way, Muslims are still forbidden to elect unbelievers. "Incidentally, if no one nominates a Muslim, then an infidel appears, Muslims must not vote, may not choose, haram, volunteering to follow the infidel." Likewise according to Dr. Zainal Abidin Bilfaqih,

³⁵Icin & Abdullah Alawi, "Hadratussyekh KH Hasyim Asy'ari Satukan Islam Dan Nasionalisme," www.nu.or.id, accessed February 11, 2019, http://www.nu.or.id/post/read/74951/hadratussyekh-kh-hasyim-asyari-satukan-islam-dan-nasionalisme. Hadratussyaikh KH Hasyim Asy'ari issued a jargon *hubbul wathan minal iman*. A decade before the Ottoman Khilafah broke up in 1924, precisely in 1915. Syakir NF & Ibnu Nawawi, "Mbah Hasyim Cetuskan Semangat Nasionalisme Dan Agama," www.nu.or.id, accessed February 11, 2019, http://www.nu.or.id/post/read/92457/mbah-hasyim-cetuskan-semangat-nasionalisme-dan-agama-. Another story related to KH nationalism. Hasyim Ash'ari, read M. Sanusi, *Kebiasaan-Kebiasaan Inspiratif KH. Ahmad Dahlan & KH. Hasyim Asy'ari* (Jogjakarta: Diva Press, 2013). 298.

³⁶Munif, November 10, 2017.

³⁷Huda Muhammad, interview.

³⁸Huda Muhammad.

M.Pd., stated that he personally had the principle of choosing Indonesian and Muslim leaders. In addition, he stated that it was natural when Muslims were led by Muslims. Moreover, the fact is that there are many better Muslims.

Meanwhile, according to Abdillah bin Hamid Baabud, in choosing the leader of the Republic of Indonesia, the principle is Democracy. So, please be democratic in sportsmanship, avoid ways that hurt democracy. Such as the use of SARA issues, hate speech, slander, hoax news dissemination, and so forth. Related to choosing a leader (servant) of the country, it does not have to be a Muslim but who has the ability. Because in the Shi'a view, the religious leaders and humanity for us are finished, that is, the holy man chosen by God, namely 12 Shi'ite Imams.

Furthermore, KH. Moh. Sholeh Bahruddin, stated that electing a state leader does not have to be Muslim. "Researcher: Choosing non-Muslim leaders, how is it *Yai*? KH. Moh. Sholeh Bahruddin: it's never mind.³⁹ KH. Moh. Sholeh Bahruddin also freed his students in electing leaders and political parties, certainly those based on Pancasila. Likewise according to Dr. H. Saifulah, MHI., There are two general criteria for a state leader, including: 1). Original Indonesian citizens and God, and 2). Nationalist and Pancasilaism. Whereas the special criteria are for Foreign Citizens (WNA) who then become Indonesian Citizens (WNI) and Pancasilaans.

Related to the prohibition on choosing leaders of different religions, according to Nadirsyah Hosen, mainly related to Al-Maidah verse 51, states that the word *awliya*, is indeed in the translation of the Al-Quran Ministry of Religion of the Republic of Indonesia as a leader. In classical interpretations such as at-Tabary and Ibn Kathir, it does not indicate the word *awliya* as a leader, but rather a kind of ally or alliance. Even from the ten books, namely the interpretation of Al-Baidhawi, the interpretation of Fi Zhailalil Qur'an, the interpretation of Jalalain, the interpretation of Al-Miqbas min, the interpretation of Ibn Abbas, the interpretation of Al-Khazin, the interpretation of Al-Biqa'i, the interpretation of Muqatil, the interpretation of Al-Miqbas min, the interpretation of Muqatil, the interpretation of Al-Miqbas min Al-Durr Al-Mansyur, Al-Khazin's interpretation, plus Ibn Kathir's interpretation, is not to interpret the *awliya* in Surah Al-Maidah verse 51 as a leader. He also asserted, choosing a leader does not have to be Islamic, as long as it has a commitment to justice. 40

³⁹Sholeh Bahruddin, interview.

⁴⁰See Nadirsyah Hosen, *Tafsir Al-Quran Di Medsos: Mengkaji Makna Dan Rahasia Ayat Suci Pada Era Media Sosial*, ed. Iqbal Dawami (Penerbit Bunyan (PT Bentang Pustaka), 2017). 72-80, 89-94.

4. Ukhuwwah Basyariyyah within the Limits of Religion

The Islamic elite in Pasuruan, in interpreting the *ukhuwwah Basyariyyah*, had in common that fellow human beings must help one another, even when KH. Imron Mutamakkin does not use the term ukhuwah, still has the same substance as the explanation. However, differences in perspective emerge related to interactions between humans with regard to religion. At the very least, there is a tendency to distinguish treatment exclusively or inclusively with regard to interactions between people when these interactions also deal with religious teachings. That means, understanding of the teachings about humanity, the teachings of Islam become the basis in their meaning.

According to Dr. H. Munif, M.Ag., *ukhuwwah Basyariyyah* is understanding the similarities of human symbols and avoiding differences that can curb brotherhood. Examples of symbols of humanity that all humans are brothers, regardless of differences in religion, ethnicity, country, and so forth. Likewise according to KH. Nurul Huda Muhammad, *ukhuwwah Basyariyyah* is helping each other in human relations. Such as helping with hunger problems, visiting neighbors when sick and ill or grieving when our neighbors die, regardless of religious differences. Different when in religious matters, it is not allowed. Like greeting.

Then according to Abdillah bin Hamid Baabud, *ukhuwwah Basyariyyah* as a guide to life for humanity. That fellow human beings are prohibited from colonizing and enslaving each other, fellow human beings are also prohibited from acting arbitrarily. Therefore, *ukhuwwah Basyariyyah* is the goal of sending the Prophets, namely to save humanity so they can live side by side, competing in goodness (Al-Baqarah verse 148) and creating peace. Including Dr. Zainal Abidin Bilfaqih, M.Pd., stated that *ukhuwwah Basyariyyah* or *ukhuwwah Insaniyyah* is mutual respect and help to help in humanity. That way, when a human experience a disaster, as fellow human beings are obliged to help him, regardless of differences in religion, ethnicity, and others. Likewise Muhammad Okbah, *ukhuwwah Basyariyyah* is a brotherhood that is woven on the basis of humanity.

As according to Dr. H. Saifulah, MHI., *ukhuwwah Basyariyyah* is a brotherhood of fellow human beings, namely one people. (Surat Al-Baqarah verse 213, Surat Al-Mukminun verse 52, and Surat Al-Anbiyaa verse 92). In fact, KH. Moh. Sholeh Bahruddin, stated that *ukhuwwah Basyariyyah* as the main meaning rather than ukhuwah itself. Thus, *ukhuwwah Basyariyyah* is one of the obligations of Thoriqah practitioners. In the context of Indonesianness, *ukhuwwah Basyariyyah* as a form of practicing Pancasila.

Realizing that religious teachings became the main basis in interpreting *ukhuwwah Basyariyyah*, researchers argued that understanding inclusive religious teachings became the

more important choice. Although, the understanding of religious teachings exclusively in the discussion above is not a problem, because it still respects and is willing to help each other in the frame of humanity. Even according to Muhammad Husain Haikal, according to the Qur'an, there is no controversy between the brotherhood of fellow Muslims and the brotherhood of fellow humans in general. Each has competencies and limits. The brotherhood of fellow Muslims demands a bond, help, guarantees, sacrifices and priorities to build Muslim societies, as well as to take action against people or groups who oppose the Islamic community and its noble values. As for the brotherhood of fellow human beings, there is demand for real work to improve fellow human beings. The brotherhood of fellow human beings manifests mutual love and mutual love for fellow humans.⁴¹

Including Kiai Maksum as the caretaker of Al-Munawir Islamic Boarding School, Krapyak Yogyakarta, while with the students when discussing the hadith of the Messenger of Allah which was narrated by Abu Dardak ra. "Whoever defends the honor of his brother without being known is concerned, surely Allah will save him from the fires of hell on the Day of Resurrection later." *Ukhuwwah basyariyyah* only saw that fellow human beings were brothers. 42

C. CONCLUSION

The meaning of ukhuwah in the perspective of the Islamic elite of Pasuruan district is divided into three perspectives, namely the exclusive, pseudo-inclusive, and inclusive-pluralist perspectives. The exclusive perspective assumes that the term ukhuwah is only for fellow Muslims. As conveyed by KH. Imron Mutamakkin (Chair of PCNU Pasuruan Regency). Then the Pseudo-Inclusive perspective is a view that gives different treatment based on differences in beliefs or religion, even after realizing the existence of multiple realities of life. So, interpreting ukhuwah, there tends to be more value when it is interwoven in the bonds of fellow Muslims. As stated by Dr. Zainal Abidin Bilfaqih, M.Pd., (Chair of ICMI Pasuruan Regency), KH. Nurul Huda Muhammad (Chairman of the MUI of Pasuruan Regency), and Muhammad Okbah (Chair of PD Muhammadiyah of Pasuruan Regency). Finally, the Inclusive-Pluralist perspective. A view that defines ukhuwah as a brotherhood of humanity, so it does not question differences in religious, religious, ethnic, and ethnic sects. In this perspective, like Dr. H. Munif, M.Ag., (Academics & Bureaucrats), Abdillah bin Hamid Baabud (Shia Cleric and Chairman of ABI East Java), KH. Moh. Sholeh Bahruddin

⁴¹Musdah Mulia, *Negara Islam*, ed. Sitok Srengenge (Depok: KataKita, 2010). 139.

⁴²Read Mohamad Sobary, *Jejak Guru Bangsa, Mewarisi Kearifan Gus Dur* (Jakarta: PT Gramedia Pustaka Utama, 2010). 28-30.

(Nurse of Pasuruan Ponpes Ngalah), and Dr. H. Saifulah, MHI. (Head of Pasuruan Regency FKUB).

Furthermore, there is a struggle for meaning in the meaning of *ukhuwwah Islamiyyah*, starting from the meaning of *ukhuwwah Islamiyyah* only as fellow Muslims with a broader meaning that *ukhuwwah Islamiyyah* is not only a brotherhood of fellow Muslims but as an Islamic teaching about brotherhood, which includes brotherhood of fellow citizens and fellow humans. While in *ukhuwwah Wathaniyyah*, there was a debate in the context of choosing a state leader who was of the same religion or not. Some religious elites forbid and other elites allow and there is a difference between choosing a state leader between choosing a Regent and the President. As for the meaning of *ukhuwwah Basyariyyah*, there are differences in perspective when the fraternal activities are related to interactions between human beings related to religion. Thus, there is a tendency to distinguish, both exclusively and inclusively, in relation to interactions between people when these interactions also deal with religious teachings. Therefore, the model of religious understanding influences the meaning of brotherhood among human beings.

Realizing all of this, as an answer to respect for the diverse perspectives of the Islamic religious elite and to reconcile spaces for contention and debate of meaning related to ukhuwah. Researchers call it a multicultural ukhuwah. A concept of brotherhood that is built in the reality of life with mutual respect for the various activities in the flow in the internal religion, interfaith, followers of the faith, social activities in general, social religion, tradition and culture, and political views, solely to strengthen and advance the country, The Unitary State of the Republic of Indonesia.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Abidin Bilfaqih, Zainal, April 18, 2018.

Adhila. "Protes Perlakuan Ahok Kepada KH Maruf Amin, NU Pasuruan Gelar Aksi Bela Ulama." http://www.suara-islam.com, 2017. http://www.suara-islam.com/read/index/21295/Protes-Perlakuan-Ahok-kepada-KH-Maruf-Amin--NU-Pasuruan-Gelar-Aksi-Bela-Ulama.

Ahmad. "Muslim Pandaan: 'Kita Doakan Polisi Segera Menangkap Ahok Atau Biar Malaikat Maut Segera Menangkapnya.'" m.hidayatullah.com, 2016. http://m.hidayatullah.com/berita/nasional/read/2016/10/29/103713/muslim-pandaan-kita-doakan-polisi-segera-menangkap-ahok-atau-biar-malaikat-maut-segera-menangkapnya.html.

Alawi, Icin & Abdullah. "Hadratussyekh KH Hasyim Asy'ari Satukan Islam Dan Nasionalisme." www.nu.or.id. Accessed February 11, 2019.

- http://www.nu.or.id/post/read/74951/hadratussyekh-kh-hasyim-asyari-satukan-islam-dan-nasionalisme.
- Ayyub, Hasan. Etika Islam (Menuju Kehidupan Yang Hakiki). Bandung: Trigenda Karya, 1994.
- www.kabarpas.com. "Beredar Pesan Broadcast Ajakan Untuk Jadi Pasukan Berani Mati," 2016. http://www.kabarpas.com/beredar-pesan-broadcast-ajakan-jadi-pasukan-beranimati/.
- Chirzin, Muhammad. "Ukhuwah Dan Kerukunan Dalam Perspektif Islam." *Aplikasia: Jurnal Aplikasi Llmu-Ilmu Agama* VIII, no. 1 (June 2007).
- Darajat, Zakiya. "Muhammadiyah Dan NU: Penjaga Moderatisme Islam Di Indonesia." HAYULA: Indonesian Journal of Multidisciplinary Islamic Studies Volume 1 (2017).
- Faridl, K.H. Miftah. *Lentera Ukhuwah: Indahnya Saling Menyayang Dalam Dekapan Iman*. Bandung: PT Mizan Pustaka, 2014.
- Fillah, Salim A. Dalam Dekapan Ukhuwah. Yogyakarta: Pro-U Media, 2010.
- www.viralnusantara.com. "Gelorakan Resolusi Jihad, Santri Pasuruan Deklarasi Pasukan Berani Mati Pengawal Fatwa MUI," 2016. http://www.viralnusantara.com/2016/10/gelorakan-resolusi-jihad-santri.html.
- Hamid Baabud, Abdillah bin, October 10, 2017.
- Hamidah. "Al-Ukhuwah al-Ijtima'iyah Wa al-Insaniyah: Kajian Terhadap Pluralisme Agama Dan Kerjasama Kemanusiaan." *Intizar* 21, no. 2 (2015).
- Hosen, Nadirsyah. *Tafsir Al-Quran Di Medsos: Mengkaji Makna Dan Rahasia Ayat Suci Pada Era Media Sosial*. Edited by Iqbal Dawami. Penerbit Bunyan (PT Bentang Pustaka), 2017.
- HS, Hairus Salim. "Pembaharuan Abdurrahman Wahid: Gagasan Dan Strategi." In *Bahan Bacaan Kelas Pemikiran Gus Dur*, n.d.
- Huda Muhammad, Nurul, July 30, 2018.
- Indri. "HTI DPD II Pasuruan Gelar Aksi Bela Islam Jilid III." pasuruantoday.net, 2016. http://pasuruantoday.net/info-pasuruan/hti-dpd-ii-pasuruan-gelar-aksi-bela-islam-jilid-iii/.
- Laili, Syarifah. "Studi Analisis Ayat-Ayat Ukhuwah Dalam Tafsir Al-Misbah Karya M. Quraish Sihab." UIN Sumatera Utara Medan, 2016.
- Marta, M. Fajar. "Islam Nusantara Untuk Dunia." In *Nasionalisme Dan Islam Nusantara*, edited by Abdullah Ubaid dan Mohammad Bakir. Jakarta: PT Kompas Media Nusantara, 2015.
- Muhammad, Husein. "Prolog: Pluralisme Sebagai Keniscayaan Teologis." In *Argumen Pluralisme Agama: Membangun Toleransi Berbasis Al-Qur'an*. Depok: Penerbit Kata Kita, 2009.
- Mulia, Musdah. Negara Islam. Edited by Sitok Srengenge. Depok: KataKita, 2010.
- Munif, September 26, 2017.
- —, November 10, 2017.
- Mutamakkin, Imron, July 25, 2018.
- Naim, Ngainun. *Islam Dan Pluralisme Agama: Dinamika Perebutan Makna*. Yogyakarta: Aura Pustaka, 2014.

- Nawawi, Syakir NF & Ibnu. "Mbah Hasyim Cetuskan Semangat Nasionalisme Dan Agama." www.nu.or.id. Accessed February 11, 2019. http://www.nu.or.id/post/read/92457/mbah-hasyim-cetuskan-semangat-nasionalismedan-agama-.
- Okbah, Muhammad, October 10, 2017.
- "Presiden: NU Penyangga Utama NKRI." Majalah Nahdlatul Ulama AULA. Surabaya, 2016.
- Rumadi. "Mengawal Pluralisme Di Tengah Kegamangan Negara." In *Politisasi Agama Dan Konflik Komunal: Beberapa Isu Penting Di Indonesia*, edited by Rumadi dan Ahmad Suaedy. Jakarta: The Wahid Institute, 2007.
- S, Harun. "Ratusan Pembela Ulama Pasuruan Bergerak Menuju Jakarta." seruji.com, 2017. https://seruji.co.id/daerah/jatim/ratusan-pembela-ulama-pasuruan-bergerak-menuju-jakarta/.
- Saifulah. Doa & Ngaji Gus Dur dalam memperingati Harlah Gus Dur ke-77 dengan tema "Melacak Spiritualitas Gus Dur," Agustus 2017.
- ——, September 30, 2017.
- Sanusi, M. Kebiasaan-Kebiasaan Inspiratif KH. Ahmad Dahlan & KH. Hasyim Asy'ari. Jogjakarta: Diva Press, 2013.
- Sholeh Bahruddin, Moh., October 11, 2017.
- Siroj, Said Aqil. "Menjaga Marwah Ulama." In *Nasionalisme Dan Islam Nusantara*, edited by Abdullah Ubaid dan Mohammad Bakir. Jakarta: PT Kompas Media Nusantara, 2015.
- . Tasawuf Sebagai Kritik Sosial: Mengedepankan Islam Sebagai Inspirasi, Bukan Aspirasi. Bandung: PT Mizan Pustaka, 2006.
- Sirry, Mun'im. *Polemik Kitab Suci: Tafsir Reformis Atas Kritik Al-Qur'an Terhadap Agama Lain.* Jakarta: PT Gramedia Pustaka Utama, 2013.
- Sobary, Mohamad. *Jejak Guru Bangsa, Mewarisi Kearifan Gus Dur*. Jakarta: PT Gramedia Pustaka Utama, 2010.
- Sugiyono. Metode Penelitian Kualitatif, Kualitatif, Dan R&D. Bandung: Alfabeta, 2012.
- Wahid, Yenny Zannuba. "Pancasila Dan Sejumlah Tantangannya." In *Dasar-Dasar Multikultural, Teori Dan Praktek*, edited by M. Kholid Murtadlo. Pasuruan: Yudharta Press, 2011.
- Yusrianto. "Pemikiran Politik Dan Perjuangan KH. M. Hasyim Asy'ari Melawan Kolonialisme." *IN RIGHT: Jurnal Agama Dan Hak Azazi Manusia* 3, no. 2 (2014).